

Local and Migrant Domestic Worker

Editorial

Local and Migrant Domestic Worker

Articles

Women and Their Journey to Self-Empowerment: A Case Study of Six Indonesian Female Migrant Domestic Workers

Safira Prabawidya Pusparani & Ani Widyani Soetjipto

Decent Work for Domestic Workers as Perceived by Employers: Results of Surveys Performed in Makassar, Surabaya, and Bandung

Ida Ruwaida

Challenging Disregard: Advocacy Journalism and the campaign for domestic worker legislation in Indonesia

Mary Austin

Domestic Workers in the Paradox of Politics of Gender and the Politics of Developmentalism: A Case Study of Indonesia in the New Order Era

Diah Irawaty

Domestic Workers' Efforts to Realize Decent Work: Learning, Organizing and Fighting

Purnama Sari Pelupessy

The Legislation Process of the Regional Regulation on Domestic Workers in the Special Region of Yogyakarta and its Challenges

Sargini, Jumiyeem, Muryanti

The Contribution of Indonesian Women Migrant Workers (TKIP) to the Welfare of Their Children

Maria Ulfah Anshor

Discrimination, Violence, and the Neglect of Rights: Domestic Workers in the Absence of Legal Protection

Anita Dhewy

Published by:



Yayasan Jurnal Perempuan

Accreditation Number: 748/Akred/P2MI-LIPI/04/2016

ISSN 1410-153X

FOUNDER

Dr. Gadis Arivia
Prof. Dr. Toeti Heraty Noerhadi-Roosseno
Ratna Syafrida Dhanny
Asikin Arif (Alm.)

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Melli Darsa, S.H., LL.M.
Mari Elka Pangestu, Ph.D.
Svida Alisjahbana

EDITOR IN CHIEF

Anita Dhewy

EDITORIAL BOARD

Dr. Gadis Arivia (Feminist Philosophy, FIB Universitas Indonesia)
Prof. Dr. Sulistyowati Irianto (Feminist Legal Anthropology, Universitas Indonesia)
Dr. Nur Iman Subono (Politics & Gender, FISIPOL Universitas Indonesia)
Prof. Sylvia Tiwon (Gender Anthropology, University California at Berkeley)
Prof. Saskia Wieringa (Women's History & Queer, Universitaet van Amsterdam)
Dr. Phil. Dewi Candraningrum (Literature and Women, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta)
Mariana Amiruddin, M.Hum (National Commission on Violence Against Women)
Yacinta Kurniasih, M.A. (Literature and Women, Faculty of Arts, Monash University)
Soe Tjen Marching, Ph.D (History and Women's Politics, SOAS University of London)
Manneke Budiman, Ph.D. (Literature and Gender, FIB Universitas Indonesia)

PEER REVIEWER

Prof. Mayling Oey-Gardiner (Demography & Gender, Universitas Indonesia)
David Hulse, PhD (Politics & Gender, Ford Foundation)
Dr. Pinky Saptandari (Politics & Gender, Universitas Airlangga)
Dr. Kristi Poerwandari (Psychology & Gender, Universitas Indonesia)
Dr. Ida Ruwaida Noor (Sociology of Gender, Universitas Indonesia)
Dr. Arianti Ina Restiani Hunga (Economics & Gender, Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana)
Katharine McGregor, PhD. (Women's History, University of Melbourne)
Prof. Jeffrey Winters (Politics & Gender, Northwestern University)
Ro'fah, PhD. (Religion & Gender, UIN Sunan Kalijaga)
Tracy Wright Webster, PhD. (Gender & Cultural Studies, University of Western Australia)
Dr. Phil. Ratna Noviani (Media & Gender, Universitas Gajah Mada)

Prof. Kim Eun Shil (Anthropology & Gender, Korean Ewha Womens University)
Prof. Merlyna Lim (Media, Technology & Gender, Carleton University)
Prof. Claudia Derichs (Politics & Gender, Universitaet Marburg)
Sari Andajani, PhD. (Medical Anthropology, Public Health & Gender, Auckland University of Technology)
Dr. Wening Udasmoro (Culture, Language & Gender, Universitas Gajah Mada)
Prof. Ayami Nakatani (Anthropology & Gender, Okayama University)
Antarini Pratiwi Arna (Law & Gender, Gender Justice Program Director-Oxfam in Indonesia)
Prof. Maria Lichtmann (Christian Theology and Feminism, Appalachian State University, USA)
Assoc. Prof. Muhamad Ali (Religion & Gender, University California, Riverside)
Assoc. Prof. Mun'im Sirry (Islamic Theology & Gender, University of Notre Dame)
Assoc. Prof. Paul Bijl (History, Culture & Gender, Universiteit van Amsterdam)
Assoc. Prof. Patrick Ziegenhain (Politics & Gender, Goethe University Frankfurt)
Assoc. Prof. Alexander Horstmann (Asian Studies & Gender, University of Copenhagen)

MANAGING EDITOR

Andi Misbahul Pratiwi

EDITORIAL SECRETARY

Abby Gina Boangmanalu
Naufaludin Ismail

SECRETARIAT AND FRIENDS OF JURNAL PEREMPUAN

Himah Sholihah
Andri Wibowo
Hasan Ramadhan

DESIGN & LAYOUT

Elisabet Dwi

ADDRESS:

Jl. Karang Pola Dalam II No. 9A, Jati Padang
Pasar Minggu, Jakarta Selatan 12540
Telp./Fax (021) 2270 1689
E-mail: yjp@jurnalperempuan.com
redaksi@jurnalperempuan.com

WEBSITE:

www.jurnalperempuan.org

First published in August 2017



FORDFOUNDATION

Contents

Editorial

Local and Migrant Domestic Worker iii

Articles

- Women and Their Journey to Self-Empowerment: A Case Study of Six Indonesian Female Migrant Domestic Workers 115-125
Safira Prabawidya Pusparani & Ani Widyani Soetjipto
- Decent Work for Domestic Workers as Perceived by Employers: Results of Surveys Performed in Makassar, Surabaya, and Bandung 127-136
Ida Ruwaida
- Challenging Disregard: Advocacy Journalism and the campaign for domestic worker legislation in Indonesia.... 137-148
Mary Austin
- Domestic Workers in the Paradox of Politics of Gender and the Politics of Developmentalism: A Case Study of Indonesia in the New Order Era 149-159
Diah Irawaty
- Domestic Workers' Efforts to Realize Decent Work: Learning, Organizing and Fighting 161-171
Purnama Sari Pelupessy
- The Legislation Process of the Regional Regulation on Domestic Workers in the Special Region of Yogyakarta and its Challenges 173-181
Sargini, Jumiyem, Muryanti
- The Contribution of Indonesian Women Migrant Workers (TKIP) to the Welfare of Their Children 183-193
Maria Ulfah Anshor
- Discrimination, Violence, and the Neglect of Rights: Domestic Workers in the Absence of Legal Protection 195-204
Anita Dhewy

Local and Migrant Domestic Worker

Domestic workers do not only play an important role in families, but also in society and the country's economy. Unfortunately, domestic workers are often overlooked, although domestic work—including care work—is a set of complex activities with deep implications on personal, social, and economic welfares, considering domestic workers who perform housework make it possible for members of (employing) households to perform social and economic activities outside their home, and this in turn allows public sectors to function. Apart from being overlooked, domestic workers are often not viewed as part of the labor force. According to Wong (2012), this is because domesticity is conventionally seen as feminine virtue, and this view limits women to domestic work and makes them reliant on men. Secondly, because mothers are already performing domestic work—without getting paid, with the assumption that these tasks are done voluntarily—domestic workers are not seen as “true workers,” due to the nature of their perceived “non-work.” Third, this type of work is often naturally viewed as women's work. Because the work can be done “naturally,” as opposed requiring skills (which would necessitate training and some sort of certification), women's work is unappreciated. The traditional view of domestic work has contributed to the invisibility of domestic workers, which is perpetuated by relations within the family, society, and systemic regulations, which are in turn manifested in low and often inadequate wages for domestic workers.

According to the International Labour Organization (ILO), 1 in 25 women workers worldwide is a domestic worker. Although a great number of men work in this sector—often as gardeners, drivers, or heads of domestic staff—the sector is a feminine sector, with women making up 80 percent of all domestic workers. In Indonesia, according to the analysis of the 2012 National Labour Force Survey (Sakernas), there are 2,555,000 domestic workers above 15 years old working in the country, 1.7 million of whom work in the Java Island (ILO 2013). Meanwhile, of the 6.5 million

Indonesian migrant workers, around 80 percent are migrant domestic workers (ILO 2012). Domestic workers in Indonesia are usually women from rural areas with low levels of education. The majority of domestic workers in Indonesia do not have clear work contracts—either verbal or written—with their employers in regard to their duties, work hours, weekly days off, and pay. Additionally, not many domestic workers have social security (Migrant CARE & Jala-PRT 2016).

Jala-PRT's data shows that as of September 2016, there were 217 cases of violence against domestic workers. Jala-PRT's National Coordinator Lita Anggraini stresses that from the perspective of zero violence, even one such case, in fact, signals a serious problem, which means that the urgency of having a legal umbrella to provide protection for domestic workers should not be based on the frequency of cases or reported incidents. On the principle of welfare, the government has the responsibility to provide protection. But the draft bill for the protection of domestic workers, proposed in 2004, has not yet been passed. Furthermore, the Indonesian government has not yet ratified ILO Convention No. 189, which mandates what constitutes as decent work for domestic workers. The mandate is in line with the Sustainable Development Goals, particularly No. 8, i.e., actualizing decent work for all workers. To this end, JP94 analyzes studies on domestic workers' steps in self-empowerment, employers' position in regard to their domestic workers, the role of media in advocacy efforts, the position of domestic workers in the New Order's gender politics, domestic workers' organizational efforts, the legislative process of the domestic workers bill in the Special Region of Yogyakarta, domestic workers' contribution to children's well-being and domestic workers' work environment in regard to violence and discrimination. We hope that our documentary collection will encourage the creation of a legal umbrella for the protection of domestic workers.

(Anita Dhewy)

Safira Prabawidya Pusparani & Ani Widayani Soetjipto
(Department of International Relations Social and Political
Science Faculty, Universitas Indonesia, Jawa Barat, Indonesia)

**Women and Their Journey to Self-Empowerment:
A Case Study of Six Indonesian Female
Migrant Domestic Workers**

DDC: 305
Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 115-125, 19 ref.

In Indonesia, female migrant domestic workers are often presented in a negative light. Although they are named as "heroes of development," they're treated as mere commodity for the benefit of the country. This treatment leaves female migrant domestic workers vulnerable to violence and exploitation by employers, agents, and government staff. Nevertheless, there is an alternative narrative that is rarely highlighted in literature or media, namely of female migrant domestic workers as powerful actors. This paper aims to fill in this alternative narrative by highlighting the actions taken by six female migrant domestic workers with agency. The author believes that by using the perspective of "standpoint feminism" to analyze these six female migrant domestic workers's struggles in self-empowerment following oppressive experiences, we may see that female migrant domestic workers have demonstrated their agency while in the process of migrating. This study reveals female domestic migrant workers showed self-empowerment in their decision to migrate amid a patriarchal structure and capacity in resisting said structure through activism, and performed roles as agents of development and transformation for their communities.

Keywords: migration, female migrant domestic workers, standpoint feminism, agency, empowerment

Ida Ruwaida (Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social and
Political Science, Universitas Indonesia, Jawa Barat, Indonesia)

**Decent Work for Domestic Workers as Perceived by
Employers: Results of Surveys Performed in Makassar,
Surabaya, and Bandung**

DDC: 305
Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 127-136, 2 graphic,
2 table, 6 ref.

This article is based on a study on the level of information, attitudes, and practices in regard to the rights and protection of domestic workers in three cities (Surabaya, Makassar, and Bandung). This paper aims to describe the working conditions of domestic workers, not from the perspective of domestic workers themselves, but rather from the perspective of their employers. An interesting discovery in this research process is the employers' tendency to adopt double standards when faced with the way employer-domestic worker relations have developed from a more social relation to an economic relation, which signals decent work for domestic workers. An economic relation between employers and domestic workers means that domestic workers must be recognized as part of the workforce, like other types of workers, and that their rights must also be fulfilled and protected. Assuming that the protection of domestic workers is the result of social development, in the context of Indonesia, a structural intervention through state policy for creating decent work for domestic workers will prove to be tough and will have to face some resistance from cultural

elements. This study's findings in three cities show that a long, guided and comprehensive social process is needed in order to build an equal and just relation between employers and domestic workers.

Keywords: decent work, protection of domestic workers, social relations, economic relations, social development, structural intervention, cultural intervention.

Mary Austin (Centre for Gender Studies, School of Oriental and
African Studies, University of London, London, UK)

**Challenging Disregard: Advocacy Journalism and
the campaign for domestic worker legislation in Indonesia**

DDC: 305
Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 137-148, 3 table, 37
ref.

This article examines a recent ILO funded project designed to engage more Indonesian journalists and media organizations in advocacy journalism on behalf of domestic worker legislation. Applying Ann Stoler's notion of 'disregard' in the context of post-Suharto democratization, I illustrate how established newsroom practices and patterns of reporting helped maintain distinctions between 'home' and overseas domestic workers which impeded progress towards comprehensive legislation. Indonesia's endorsement of the adoption of ILO Convention 189 in June 2011 opened up political opportunities, provided a framework for re-scripting media narratives and encouraged journalists to give more space to domestic workers' voices. At the same time, increased media coverage enabled those opposed to legislation to reiterate a gendered disregard for the social and economic value of domestic work.

Keywords: advocacy journalism, domestic workers, Indonesia, disregard, victim narratives.

Diah Irawaty (Department of Anthropology, State University of
New York [SUNY] Binghamton, New York, United States)

**Domestic Workers in the Paradox of Politics of
Gender and the Politics of Developmentalism:
A Case Study of Indonesia in the New Order Era**

DDC: 305
Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 149-159, 56 ref.

The New Order regime produced and applied two contradictory forms of gender politics as political control over women, so that women would adhere to the state's narrative of the ideal woman. On the one hand, Suharto campaigned for state maternalism to endorse the ideal good mother, or one that performs domestic work full-time. Such women are claimed to be the pillars of the nation. On the other hand, the government endorsed the politics of developmentalism based on the "women in development" perspective and campaigned for women's participation in the national development agenda. Women were encouraged to leave the home, and even to be willing to leave their family. How were (the contradictions between) the two political approaches applied to domestic workers? What sociopolitical contexts were behind these political approaches? And how were/are domestic workers affected?

Keywords: Gender Politics, Developmentalism, International Division of Labor, Sexual/ Reproductive Division of Labor

Purnama Sari Pelupessy (Mitra Imadei, Jakarta, Indonesia)

**Domestic Workers' Efforts to Realize Decent Work:
Learning, Organizing and Fighting**

DDC: 305

Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 161-171, 1 picture, 3 table, 17 ref.

This paper discusses the situation of domestic workers (PRT) and the author's process—as a community organizer—of organizing domestic workers. Using a feminist framework, the author explores the history of oppression of women in regard to unpaid domestic work and in its impacts on current domestic workers, who are paid low wages. This article also discusses the state's attitude in viewing domestic workers as workers, as citizens and as women, as well as the state's reluctance to ratify ILO Convention No. 189 as well as the draft bill on the protection of domestic workers. The author uses her experience in and knowledge of the labor movement and is informed by the particular characteristics of domestic workers. This study concludes that efforts to change domestic workers' working conditions must be done by organizing domestic workers, so that they have the power to urge the state to realize decent work.

Keywords: Female domestic workers, domestic workers union, decent work, Domestic Workers Protection Bill

Sargini, Jumiye, Muryanti (The Tunas Mulia Domestic Workers Union [SPRT], Yogyakarta, Indonesia)

**The Legislation Process of the Regional Regulation
on Domestic Workers in the Special Region of Yogyakarta
and its Challenges**

DDC: 305

Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 173-181, 5 table, 12 ref.

This paper examines the legislation process of the Proposed Regional Regulation on Domestic Workers (Raperda PRT) in DIY. The regional regulation is crucial because domestic workers play a significant role for the working family and for those who are active in the public sphere. This resulted in an increased demand for the profession each year. Unfortunately, the absence of a governing regulation for the profession has led to very unclear and messy practices in the working relationship between the Domestic Worker (DW/PRT) and the customer (service user). Violations of the employment relationship have become frequent occurrences, including violence experienced by domestic workers, whether physical, psychological, economic, sexual or social. In Yogyakarta, the Domestic Workers Protection Network (JPPRT) of the Special Region of Yogyakarta (DIY) has suggested that the various type of violence experienced by domestic workers cannot be viewed separately from the absence of a regulation that governs the working relationship between domestic workers and their service users. Against this background, the JPPRT decided to pioneer and propose a draft for regional regulation on domestic workers in the Special Region of Yogyakarta (DIY).

Keywords: domestic workers protection, Proposed Regional Regulation on Domestic Workers, Domestic Workers Protection Network (JPPRT), political support

Maria Ulfah Anshor (Indonesian Commission on Child Protection [KPAI], Jakarta, Indonesia)

**The Contribution of Indonesian Women Migrant Workers
(TKIP) to the Welfare of Their Children**

DDC: 305

Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 183-193, 19 ref.

This article is part of the dissertation research on the care of Indonesian Women Migrant Workers' (TKIP) children in pesantren (Islamic boarding school), using a qualitative approach and an analysis unit on these children and their environment. This study applies Bronfenbrenner's ecological system theory and the "global care chain" concept with a child protection perspective. Our results show that TKIP's children who are left behind by their mothers who have gone overseas, lose "care", their welfare is psychologically and socially disrupted, and experience mutual dependence between them, their family and the TKIP overseas; the *pesantren* (Islamic boarding school) has become an option for TKIP's family because there are no professional child cares to care for the children of TKIP when their mothers have gone overseas. Institutionally, the pesantren has the potential to break the global care chain of injustices in regard to the care for TKIP's children, with the support of religious values and pesantren traditions. But policy support is needed to guarantee the community-based care and social welfare of TKIP's children, comprehensively integrated into the policy blueprint for Indonesian migrant workers.

Keywords: Childcare of migrant workers, children's rights and child welfare.

Anita Dhewy (Jurnal Perempuan, Jakarta, Indonesia)

**Discrimination, Violence, and the Neglect of Rights:
Domestic Workers in the Absence of Legal Protection**

DDC: 305

Jurnal Perempuan, Vol. 22 No. 3, Agustus 2017, pp. 195-204, 15 ref.

This paper focuses on the experiences of domestic workers who have been subjected to violence, discrimination and the neglect of rights by employers as well as apartment managements where these domestic workers work. The data of six domestic workers from diverse backgrounds who were interviewed in depth reflects the violence experienced by all domestic workers at work. There are forms of violence that can be easily recognized as violence, but some types of discrimination and violence are not viewed as violence or are simply seen as the norm. These types of discrimination and violence are usually associated with inappropriate/indecent work conditions. Domestic workers' vulnerability, because their work falls under the private domain, is the result of the absence of laws to protect domestic workers at work. This is why a legal umbrella for the protection of domestic workers, like other types of workers, is a fundamental need.

Keywords: violence, discrimination, neglect of rights, bill on the protection of domestic workers

Challenging Disregard: Advocacy Journalism and the Campaign for Domestic Worker Legislation in Indonesia

Mary Austin

Centre for Gender Studies, School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London
10, Thornhaugh Street, Russell Square, London WC1H 0XG

526396@soas.ac.uk

Manuscript Chronology: received June 28, 2017; revised July 19, 2017; approved for publication 31 July 2017

Abstract

This article examines a recent ILO funded project designed to engage more Indonesian journalists and media organizations in advocacy journalism on behalf of domestic worker legislation. Applying Ann Stoler's notion of 'disregard' in the context of post-Suharto democratization, I illustrate how established newsroom practices and patterns of reporting helped maintain distinctions between 'home' and overseas domestic workers which impeded progress towards comprehensive legislation. Indonesia's endorsement of the adoption of ILO Convention 189 in June 2011 opened up political opportunities, provided a framework for re-scripting media narratives and encouraged journalists to give more space to domestic workers' voices. At the same time, increased media coverage enabled those opposed to legislation to reiterate a gendered disregard for the social and economic value of domestic work.

Key words: advocacy journalism, domestic workers, Indonesia, disregard, victim narratives.

Introduction

From the mid-1980s onwards, Indonesian journalists published stories denouncing the abuse and exploitation of migrant domestic workers without equivocation. Editors regarded such stories as 'hot news', media coverage was extensive and audiences responded with calls for legal protection, or at times, bans on women seeking domestic work overseas (Robinson 1991, pp. 48–50; Blackburn 2004, pp. 188–191). However, while the media framed abuse of overseas workers as shocking and shaming, abuse of domestic workers inside Indonesia was looked at differently. Well-known feminist activist and senior *Jakarta Post* journalist, Ati Nurbaiti, pointed this out in a paper she gave at an international conference in Manila in August 2000 where she cited an anonymous editor who believed the public was only outraged when ill treatment of workers inside the nation took the form 'of extreme physical abuse carried out by Chinese Indonesians' (Nurbaiti 2000). On other occasions journalists explained away abuse as being perpetrated by 'bad' women¹ or the mentally unwell.² In this way, victimization of 'home' domestic workers could be seen as exceptional rather than endemic, a private matter rather than a public one. Indeed, journalists and editors tended to share a 'common-sense' belief that domestic work inside Indonesia was

largely unproblematic and even altruistic, providing work for the needy.

Reluctance to recognise structural similarities between home and overseas domestic work continues to be a major obstacle in the path of progress towards an Indonesian Domestic Workers' law. It delays Indonesia's ratification of ILO Convention 189. The fact that Indonesia does not have a law to protect its own workers hinders negotiations over bilateral agreements with destination countries for migrant domestic workers and discourages regional governments in Indonesia from passing their own legislation in advance of a national framework. Meanwhile employers know that when domestic workers try to discuss work contracts they are under no compulsion to follow guidance issued by the government or the ILO.

Supporters of the domestic workers' movement will better understand why care work in Indonesia continues to be devalued and why the Domestic Workers' Bill remains in a state of stasis if they are more conversant with what motivates and supports journalists in challenging media narratives which set apart home and overseas domestic work. This article contributes to that broader understanding by examining one aspect of an ILO funded project called PROMOTE, a strand of which aimed to engage journalists and media organizations

in advocacy journalism on behalf of domestic worker legislation. AJI, the Alliance of Independent Journalists, played a key role in the scheme.

The article draws on ongoing research for my doctoral thesis, including five periods of fieldwork in Jakarta and Yogyakarta between 2012 and 2016. I met twenty-one journalists (the majority of whom were involved in advocacy) and discussed media activism with activists, AJI officials, ILO officers and a member of the DPR. I asked them about their motivation and standpoints; involvement with the domestic worker movement; experiences of researching and publishing stories about domestic workers and views on reader responses and editorial decision making. I attended press conferences, training sessions and an award ceremony for journalists. Internet data such as personal profiles, project documentation and NGO websites provided additional detail and allowed crosschecking of information. Two graduate research assistants and staff from the *Wisma Bahasa* Language School assisted with interviews, data collection and translation.³

Ann Stoler, in her deeply empirical (as well as theoretically complex) study of the Dutch colonial archive, *Along the Archival Grain*, talks of a 'politics of disregard'. This was a means whereby colonial administrators and their families coped with the cognitive dissonance between ideals of empire and their own privileges, on the one hand, and the stark realities of colonial rule (such as the brutal treatment of coolie labour) on the other. This colonial 'disposition of disregard' entailed a state of 'knowing and not knowing', or of 'seeming' not to know which was sustained by 'clunky, scripted stereotypes' of indigenous people and places as well as by self-deception (Stoler 2009, pp. 201–212). Transferring this understanding to the post-Suharto period, a time itself marked by discrepancies between ideals of democratization and media revelations of corruption, wealth inequalities and collusion between business and the military (see, for example, the account of post-Suharto journalism in Steele 2011a, pp. 86–99), this article examines a similar 'disinterest' in domestic worker rights. If, in Stoler's reading of the archive, concerns about race stood out as 'a paramount sentiment in the official colonial mind' (Gouda et al. 2009, p. 559), in this article issues of gender and class come to the fore.

The article has three parts. Part one establishes a baseline against which advocacy journalism needed to work by analysing a sample of articles about domestic work published in *Kompas* in 2004 and 2008. Part two highlights structural barriers to publishing home

domestic work stories. Part three analyses journalists' involvement in the PROMOTE project. I argue that while journalists succeeded in creating new scripts for writing about domestic work, the project also gave further publicity to the view that Indonesian domestic workers should sacrifice decent pay and conditions in the name of nationalist modernity. Such an argument, I suggest, was based on a continuing disregard of the social and economic value of domestic work.

Abuse, Distrust and Dependency: Stock Stories of Domestic Work

As Indonesia's most influential and widely circulating daily newspaper *Kompas* provides a plausible snapshot of mainstream media coverage of domestic worker issues. *Kompas's* forceful reporting on abuse of domestic workers in Saudi Arabia and elsewhere in the 1980s and 1990s had also led the way in feminist advocacy journalism (Nurbaiti 2000; Nababan 2003). A search at the *Kompas* office using the search terms PRT, *pembantu* and *pekerja rumah tangga*, and RUU PRT produced sixty-five articles once stories about overseas domestic work had been discarded; twenty-nine published in 2004 (the year JALA PRT was founded) and thirty-six in 2008, the year before widespread consultation on the ILO Convention began.⁴ Compared with press coverage about overseas domestic work, where, I have suggested elsewhere, domestic workers symbolize a struggle between the state and its citizens as well as being emblematic of the state (Austin 2016), in this sample, with few exceptions, difficulties are between individuals, many in the domestic sphere. Dominant themes reflect unease but no consistent sense of outrage or demand for change.

Abuse

Women feature as victims, mainly of abuse by employers but also as subject to workplace accident, suicide, deceit or other misfortunes in over half the sixty-five stories collected. Perpetrators are portrayed as exceptional and the everyday exploitation of female domestic workers is normalized. Two examples illustrate this point. The case of a prominent politician accused of rape by a 19-year-old domestic worker who had escaped from his residence just as he was standing for election as Governor of Lampung dominated the headlines in 2008. *Kompas* interviewed the victim and profiled the feminist NGO defending her case but the bulk of the reporting revolves around the fact that the alleged perpetrator is a 'big man', shifting attention away from the system of domestic work towards the machinery of justice. Even

though cases involving politicians and high-up officials recur regularly in the press, these stories emphasize exceptionality, allowing everyday exploitation to be overlooked.

A second story, that of the death of one worker, Maryati, in January 2004 demonstrates that media representation, even in cases which illustrate the vulnerability of domestic workers in 'ordinary' homes, can be complicated. Under the headline *Buried in the Backyard* an extraordinary event is recounted in a surprisingly matter of fact way. We learn that Maryati had worked in a luxurious house in an affluent suburb, was beaten and subject to surveillance, was probably starving and that: 'one day the family driver found out the employer had killed Maryati and buried her body in the back yard; he reported the case to the police. Maryati's employer claimed she killed her because she had stolen bread (ILO Jakarta 2010, p. 4).⁵ With observers testifying to her earlier ill-treatment and a confession, her virtuous victimhood seemed secure.

Yet, a follow-up story published two days later complicates matters. With the headline *Hoping Maryati Case will be Completed Soon*, a reporter quotes the vice chair of the *Rukun Warga* (RW) where Maryati died as saying that 'he sensed some oddities in Maryati's case'.⁶ Although in June 2003, when Maryati's father had come to take her home she had initially appeared willing, 'after she ... met her father again, she refused to go with him ... suddenly she didn't want to acknowledge her father any more'. No further explanation is given. The reader is left guessing, but the effect is to raise doubt; perhaps Maryati is not all she seems? The RW's comments introduce moral uncertainty, the interjection of what Carol Chan, in her discussion of victim narratives of migrant domestic work, terms a 'gendered hierarchy of morality' which allows 'incompatible notions of

exploitation and development' to coexist (2014, p. 6). As if to further reassure readers, another local official described the case as 'very unfortunate [and] ... not supposed to happen in an area like this'. The official rationalizes his unease by differentiating the perpetrator's family from the rest of the community; they 'looked normal from the outside, however they did not socialize and everyone knew this abuse case wasn't the first to happen in [that] household. Their past domestic worker was also abused and ... escaped from the house'.

Maryati was not invisible. Perhaps, seeing this case as one of domestic violence, locals found it prudent not to interfere. A broad-based study of masculinity and violence against women in Indonesia suggests that harsh verbal reprimands were accepted as the norm and that a 'discourse of denial' operates in Indonesian cities where 'the best tactic for maintaining neighbourhood harmony is not to notice' (Nilan et al. 2014, p. 7, p. 12, p. 16). Normalization, ambiguity and exceptionalism characterize much media coverage of domestic worker abuse in Indonesia. Exceptionalism allows journalists and readers to forget quickly; another domestic worker story will soon come to replace last month's news. Indeed, after this second article, Maryati seems to disappear from the *Kompas* record, at least, no further reports surfaced in this particular search: discomfort about her death, one might infer, was swiftly followed by disregard.

Distrust

A second group of stories presents domestic workers as a source of angst about the complexities of contemporary urban life. A glance at the headlines in Table 1 suggests the tone of the reporting.

Table 1: Kompas articles with the theme of distrust

Date	Headline
14/01/2004	Domestic Worker Kidnapped 2 Children of Employer Only to ask Rp 200,000
02/02/2004	Taking Savings Book and ID, Domestic Worker Steals from Employer
13/08/2004	Working for a Day, Domestic Worker Steals Diamonds
30/09/2004	Denying Stealing, Domestic Worker Abused by Police
19/10/2004	Persuaded by Friend, Domestic Worker Robs Her Employer
24/10/2004	Stealing After Being Hypnotized
22/11/2004	Disguising as Domestic Worker Recruitment Agency
09/01/2008	Former Domestic Worker Suspect in Police Officer's Family Murders Case
15/01/2008	Be Careful Choosing Domestic Workers from an Agency

Date	Headline
25/03/2008	Hypnotic Criminal Stops Domestic Worker in the Street
04/04/2008	Domestic Worker Steals Jewellery
19/04/2008	Experiences of Using Domestic Worker Agency
01/09/2004	Hurt by Her Employer, Domestic Worker Mutilates her Boss
12/10/2008	Domestic Workers, Easy and Difficult
02/12/2008	Accused of Stealing a Laptop, Domestic Worker Abused by Police

Source: Kompas library (2004 & 2008); KOMPAS.com(2008).

Employers fear domestic workers will turn out not to be hard working, docile and grateful for their jobs, but may steal from them or kidnap their children. Workers put desire for consumer goods above loyalty; others, duped by ‘hypnotists’ or merely greedy, take diamonds or jewellery. Nor can domestic worker agencies be trusted to provide suitable employees; they too may be dishonest. One-off examples of criminality or unreliability reinforce a good woman/bad woman binary and contribute to a climate where surveillance of domestic workers—for example searching their rooms—appears justifiable. Anne-Marie Fechter (2007) noted that ‘inspecting’ their domestic workers’ space was common practice amongst middle class employers in

Jakarta. Rehearsing employers’ anxieties and crediting nostalgia, such reporting diverts attention from what might constitute reasonable conditions for domestic work in ‘modern’ Indonesia. Instead claims for higher wages or more paid leave can be disregarded if employers can only screen out ‘difficult’ workers before they begin.

Dependency

A third group of stories centers around *mudik*, the annual return of city dwellers to their hometowns or villages for *Lebaran* as shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Kompas articles with the theme of dependency

Date	Headline
08/11/2004	Domestic Workers Go Home on Eid
12/11/2004	Difficulties of Domestic Workers taking Leave
12/12/2004	Family Dependency on Domestic Workers
05/09/2008	Getting close to Eid, Demand for Substitute Domestic Workers Rises
22/09/2008	Jakarta Left with no Domestic Workers when they Need them Most
27/09/2008	Make mudik fun for PRT so they return
05/10/2008	Employers Worried their Domestic Workers will not Return

Source: Kompas Library (2004, 2008); KOMPAS.com (2008).

Here again scripts follow a pattern. One story line is the impossibility of managing city life without household help; middle class wives anxious to live up to cultural expectations that they ‘manage’ their households are reluctant to ask husbands or sons to help. Another is the inflated price of *infal* (temporary domestic workers hired for the holiday period). Owners of domestic worker agencies seek to justify high rates and one-off fees, yet there remains a sense that somehow workers and agencies are taking advantage. Formerly trusted domestic workers may not return, having found overseas work, better paid work, or work nearer their homes. As Julia Suryakusuma explained when I discussed domestic worker issues with her as

part of my research, employers can feel deeply hurt (and ascribe blame) when an employee with whom they believed they had a ‘mutual’ relationship nevertheless fails to return (2015, interview 24 October). Employers share with journalists their strategies for ensuring workers come back, such as organizing return transportation, withholding salary or giving ‘prizes’ for a prompt report back to work (“Si Mbak Mudik Asyik Agar Balik Lagi [2]” 2008). Rhetoric of dependency and blame militates against mutual understanding and reinforces a politics of disregard by shifting the focus to (some) workers’ lack of decency. Striking, in these stories, is the large amount of space given to the voice of the employer.

The few articles reporting on the domestic worker movement operate in a different register. Journalists introduce new vocabulary — *memberdayakan* (empowerment), *hak-hak* (rights) and *keterampilan* (skills)—running counter to the frequent use of words such as victim, abuse, torture, rape, theft, kidnap, robbery and deception in the articles discussed so far. One 2004 headline, '*Pramuwisma Minta Diperhatikan Nasibnya*' (Domestic workers asking for more attention to their fate), though using the euphemistic *pramuwisma* (housekeeper) rather than the ILO and JALA preferred *pekerja* (worker) and the religiously inflected 'fate' rather than 'rights', nonetheless recognizes the potential power of domestic worker voices in making claims.

Backroom barriers

If stock scripts tended to reinforce disregard, so too did the culture in many newsrooms which discounted the news value of 'home' domestic worker stories. Feminist media scholar Carolyn Byerly recommends moving beyond micro-level analysis of media representations of women to explore the environment within which journalists operate, where, she suggests, 'the gender politics of media texts is located' (2016, pp. 18–19). Three aspects of newsroom culture were mentioned frequently by my journalist informants as working against the inclusion of stories other than the routine.⁷

First, editors believed that home domestic worker stories had scant news value. Journalists told Arum Ratnawati, National Chief Technical Adviser for the PROMOTE project, that they 'find it very hard to get the issue of the RUU PRT published ... editors are not always ready to give them space' (Ratnawati 2015, interview 10 July). One journalist described the problem thus: even if you feel you ought to write about domestic worker issues, he said:

Stories about PRT just don't get enough clicks ... so we can't run them. If we compare PRT stories with, for example, other news stories, like, you name it, corruption, road accidents, eleven people killed and so on, PRT stories do not do well, except maybe for exceptional cases where the PRT gets hit by her boss, then OK, it becomes good news value and we will grab it and take a photographer and make a story of it. (AJI member 2015, interview 15 July)

In other words, exceptionality wins. A *Tempo* journalist confided that 'other big newspaper editors are likely to be reluctant to cover marginalized issues such as domestic workers' ... there is always more

important news' (*Tempo* journalist 2016, interview 6 March; KBR journalist 2016, interview 6 March). Editors may be uninterested even where the story is about parliamentary proceedings; a journalist recalled the response when he tried to persuade his news desk to run a story on a draft regulation:

Well, we held a meeting, blah blah, and it was just as I explained before, the reaction was that this was not a news story because nothing had happened, nothing has changed, so this is not news. Anyone can submit a draft regulation. (AJI member 2015, interview 15 July)

His article was published but 'did not garner any response from readers'. Thwarted by editors and facing disinterest from readers there was little to encourage journalists to bring domestic worker issues to the fore.

Second, following widespread publicity surrounding demonstrations supporting the Domestic Workers Bill and ILO Convention 189 from 2010 onwards, managers and editors came to view domestic worker stories as 'old news'. Luviana Aryanti, who after her three-year-long dispute with Metro TV devoted much of her time to supporting the domestic worker movement, explained:

I know what journalists need, they need something new. Truly, the PRT movement is something they have been getting information about so the information is no longer new ... demonstrations are still important if the movement can build more support from below, but otherwise demonstrations are boring...journalists won't come to press conferences unless the issue is new'. (Luviana 2015, interview 30 June)

Sri Wahyuni, reporting from Yogyakarta about stage performances domestic workers put on there in 2004, was thrilled because 'this [PRT theatre] was new then, workers were speaking with their own voice ... but now the domestic worker story has been around a long time' (Wahyuni 2016, interview 1 March). Another committed journalist told me she thought media strategy needed to change - 'it's no longer about hunger strikes or demonstrations' (*Kompas* journalist 2015, interview 13 August). Political stalemate thus led editors to dismiss stories other than abuse sagas as non-events. Ati Nurbaiti had summed it up in her Manila conference paper: writing about domestic workers in Indonesia replicated a broader pattern of reporting about women - 'too much focus on "agonizing" and too little on "organizing", the latter a long, grueling process few find interesting' (2000).

A third factor was a lack of training. This comment was often made by journalists who had attended training or whose political standpoint pushed them towards

interventionist journalism. They identified a need not only for up-to-date information and access to networks, but guidance on suitable 'angles' to take and insight into different perspectives (*BeritaSatuTV* journalist 2016, interview 6 March). One journalist had met a range of experts at training sessions and checked out her thinking with them; nevertheless, half-way through her fellowship she confessed - 'I haven't decided what side to take' (*Tempo* journalist 2015, interview 14 July).

Journalists spoke about media owners' influence on editorial decisions. One commented that whereas stories about migrant domestic workers are important 'because government and big business make a lot of money out of them, political parties are not interested in domestic workers at home where 'no money is involved' (Jakarta journalist 2012, interview 28 June). Three *Kompas* journalists repeated this view - confident that migrant workers get 'top headlines' because they are 'good business'; they were hazy about the last time their paper carried a story about home domestic work. They seemed to take the domestic division of labour as given, explaining that, 'we have a patrilineal society, maybe'; 'for me, I have to work and earn money ... my wife has to stay in the house and not do anything and take care of my kids' and 'as for PRT, well, you cannot see them as other women workers, that's different in Indonesian terms... but it's not to do with gender, but with *budaya* or culture' (*Kompas* journalists 2012, interview 27 June).

Studying domestic work in Brazil, Santana Pinho argued that similar 'common sense' assumptions, such as that poor people should know their place or black bodies are unclean, were left unquestioned because their 'taken-for-granted-ness' enabled middle and upper class employers to rationalize the 'wretchedness' of domestic workers with whom they lived in close proximity (2015, p. 104). Added to the backroom barriers, then, were customary predispositions not to notice certain categories of class and gender based discrimination.

A Journalism Scheme

To counter such barriers, in June 2015 AJI Jakarta advertised a fellowship scheme (*Beasiswa Peliputan*) to encourage journalists to promote the eradication of child domestic labor and a Domestic Workers' law (AJI Jakarta 2015). AJI Jakarta was the lead partner but the scheme, as part of the larger, five-year, ILO PROMOTE project, drew on the expertise of key partners including domestic worker unions, employers' associations and women's organizations linked with JALA PRT and JARAK, a network of organizations working to eradicate child labor (U.S.

Department of Labor 2012). The scheme offered awards of Rp5 million each to successful applicants. Since the average monthly wage of a journalist in Jakarta was only around Rp3-4 million, the sum was worthwhile (*Jakarta Post* 3 May 2016). Journalists were invited to join a three-day workshop in a hotel in Bogor (itself an attraction) and submit proposals for articles or broadcasts. Applicants had to get permission from managers to participate and editors had to promise to publish stories within a specified period in August 2015. The scheme sat alongside other media focused activities in the capital and in Lampung, East Java and South Sulawesi, including training NGOs and domestic worker organizations to work with the media, training journalists and editors, encouraging domestic workers to engage in citizen journalism and offering awards for the best coverage of domestic worker issues from June 2015 to September 2016.⁸

Several senior journalists and editors gave the project their blessing, helping counter barriers at the institutional level. Jajang Jamaludin, a senior editor at *Tempo* magazine and member of the management committee for AJI's school of journalism, along with Monique Rijkers, an award winning former *Metro TV* producer whose work on violence against women was well respected, acted as mentors to the fellowship holders. Nurul Hamami, senior political editor at *Republika*, Indonesia's third most-read newspaper in 2012 (Steele 2013, p. 27) sponsored a journalist and gave the resulting articles a front-page slot for three successive days. Not only did he find it 'an honor to work with Lita Anggraini (Coordinator of the National Network for Domestic Worker Advocacy, JALA PRT) and see her dedication and commitment', he believed that *Republika's* investment in democratization—'which makes it the right of every citizen to get a proper job in terms of benefit, health facility and others'—merited support for domestic workers' claims (Nurul Hamami 2015, interview 21 August). Supporting the project mobilized what Janet Steele calls the 'paraideology' of Islamic journalism - 'the goal of justice' (2011b, p. 543) - and reinforced feminist arguments that Islam and women's rights are compatible.

The nine journalists awarded fellowships came from a range of organizations including long established print publications, radio and TV stations and new online media. Several fellowship holders were recent graduates in media and journalism, representing a new generation of journalists who had not worked during the Suharto era. The group was diverse in background and religion: the selection panel, pleased with the number and

quality of applicants and the support from editors, was optimistic that the project would ‘change journalists’ understanding and open their minds... for the long term’ (Ahmad Nurhasim, Chairman of AJI Jakarta 2015, interview 15 July).

The Published Stories

Given the support of the scheme, what stories did the selected journalists choose to tell? Did they undermine established myths which differentiated home from overseas domestic work? Did they give domestic workers space to speak for themselves? Did they introduce new tropes to replace old stereotypes? Fellowship journalists were expected to foreground workers’ rights yet

incorporate employers’ views. Arum Ratnawati told me this issue was raised in training sessions:

Actually, one thing we discussed with the journalists was how to find a middle way. The employer needs to see something of their viewpoint in any articles, so journalist need to write about the interests and needs of the employers who also have rights (Ratnawati 2015, interview 10 July).

As a collection, their articles record a moment when domestic workers, NGO activists, employers, politicians, government and media were in dialogue. They reveal discordant relationships but can also be read as an exercise in re-inscription: a palimpsest, perhaps. Table 3 gives the headlines of the seventeen stories journalists on the scheme produced.

Table 3: AJI fellowship stories published/broadcast 18 August to 19 September 2015

Journalist(s)	Headlines	Media Outlet
<i>Vela Andapita & Muhammad Irham.</i>	When Domestic Workers Organize (parts 1 & 2); Steep road of Draft Law on Protection of Domestic Workers.	<i>Varia.id</i>
<i>Andi Ikhbal</i>	Workers are still considered helpers; DPR still plays Ping pong with PRT Bill; Still not maximal push for domestic workers’ protection.	<i>Republika</i>
<i>Ignatius Herjanjam</i>	National Child Protection Commission: Urgent, the abolition of child domestic work.	<i>Suara Pembaruan</i>
<i>Carlos Michael Kodoati</i>	Hope for the children of the coast.	<i>BeritaSatu TV</i>
<i>Quinawaty Pasaribu</i>	Sunarti: My hands blister when washing clothes; Lita Anggraini: Our life and death for the Law on Protection of Domestic Workers.	<i>68H News Portal</i>
<i>Nurika Manan</i>	Lack of OSH protection for Domestic Workers (parts 1&2).	<i>KBR Saga</i>
<i>Augustinus Beo da Costa</i>	Without contract, workers’ rights unprotected.	<i>Kontan daily</i>
<i>Mitra Tarigan</i>	No Disappearance of Modern Slavery	<i>Koran Tempo</i>
<i>Abraham Utama & Utami Diah Kusumawati</i>	Child domestic workers in cycle of abuse; Being domestic workers way out for Country Girls to avoid Marriage; Stories of child domestic workers hunting for small change.	<i>CNN Indonesia</i>

Sources: http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/WCMS_528125/lang--en/index.htm; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CM_jKY_R_Xo; <http://www.republika.co.id/berita/koran/halaman-1/15/08/21/ntf1w623-belum-ada-usaha-maksimal-lindungi-prt-bagian-3-habis>.

Rewriting Victimhood

Fifteen of the eighteen stories refer to abuse, but in ways that illustrate endemic disregard as much as episodic exceptionalism. Journalists detail names, places of origin and young ages of victims not only to validate their victimhood and encourage readers to identify with the ‘victims’ but to illustrate processes of agency and transformation. Journalists use worker narratives to evince shame rather than pity – shame that Indonesian employers (like employers overseas) withhold wages or pay very low wages, and shame that in poorer regions young women still have little choice. Thus while the need to ‘prove’ victimization and the naming of victims

of trafficking, particularly in the context of international migration, can be deeply problematic, here the use of the trope of victimhood is more in line with what feminist media scholar Sally Munt has suggested is a ‘push toward a more redistributive social imaginary’ (2016, p. 14).⁹ Although stories record child trafficking, confinement, confiscation of mobile phones, physical and sexual abuse, broken promises about wages and workloads, punishment for perceived mistakes, extreme overwork and exposure to unsafe working conditions, in every case the victim’s story occupies only a small percentage of the article or broadcast. At least equal space is given to thematic analysis and advocacy.

Collectively, these narratives undermine myths of the mutual benefits and familial framing of *ngenger*.¹⁰ Everyday exploitation is shown as the norm. Readers meet ordinary housewives who nonetheless, treat the children they employ differently from their own, just as Stoler introduced her readers to a broad swathe of 'colonial actors ... neither particularly malicious nor sympathetic' but, (citing W.E.B. Du Bois) 'calm, good [women and] men' (2009, p. 249). Journalists challenge the good women/bad women binary; Ratmi, a 16-year-old, called her employer '*majikan baik*' (a good employer) even though she did not send her to school. Erly, an employer, took on 15-year-old from a neighbour, knowing 'she was still very young' because 'she was already experienced, and submissive' and would accept a low wage, yet later raised the young woman's salary and allowed her to visit family twice a month.

Instead of blaming 'bad' women, journalists implicate Indonesian society. Readers see the profit-oriented and sometimes duplicitous practices of agents and brokers - so similar to practices long condemned in relation to overseas work. One sponsor admitted that 'the fees from employers are very tempting ... even higher than expected. I can earn between Rp700,000 and Rp1.2 million for every child I bring to Jakarta'. Another broker, who supplies child domestic workers to the affluent Menteng area of Jakarta, entices young women from the village with comments such as: 'So how? You want to be back or not? It's better than doing this (breaking up the skin of paddy oats which had been dry-fried with sand)'. Three journalists report on regions where poverty, substandard schooling and lack of alternative employment still drive families to allow their daughters to leave school early to start domestic work. Rather than being treated 'as one of the family', however, young women are depicted as lonely and homesick.

Contributing Citizens

Some of the articles appropriate the notion of employer dependency, turning it to the workers' advantage. Whereas stock stories of domestic work make an implicit appeal to workers' loyalty and sense of duty, in the fellowship accounts, the rhetorical appeal is to justice for employees. Journalists present workers as entitled to recognition and reward for their contribution to society. One journalist quotes a sociologist at the University of Indonesia who found that most employers fail to recognize the economic contribution domestic workers make - even 'career families who have children [who] do not want to pay the rate for child care services

which can cost up to millions of rupiah per day' (Ikhbal 2017).

Journalists also show domestic workers contributing to local communities. Murtini, described as the 'ideal example of an empowered PRT', regularly assists fellow workers. Articles about Tunas Mulia and Sapulidi trade unions show sisterhood in action. Such writing mobilizes the idea of *gotong royong*, a term, which, in this context alludes to 'mutual assistance' and 'a philosophy of life which takes the collective life as the most important' (Bowen 1986, p. 545). *Gotong royong* could also be used against domestic workers: a senior AJI official told me he had heard ministers 'use the argument that local wisdom in Indonesia, for example, *gotong royong*, is not totally in line with the ILO Convention, but is in fact preferable' (AJI official 2015, interview 15 July). Rather than mounting a direct challenge, however, these articles seek to persuade by linking domestic worker rights with a shared understanding of village values and collective struggles for the national good.

Trusted modern professional

In the fellowship stories, journalists replace tropes of anxiety and distrust with examples of professional relationships underpinned by work contracts. In place of uncertainty and feelings that workers take advantage, employers are shown to benefit from contracts as much as workers: contracts are binding, so employers need no longer fear workers will leave unexpectedly; contracts specify duties and hours of work, removing worries about 'paying workers "to do nothing all day"'. In place of fears of theft or the ignorant misuse of household equipment, workers trained in health and safety are shown to be willing and able take more responsibility. In place of a belief that inexperienced, submissive and low paid workers are the most desirable, journalists demonstrate that contracts allow for flexibility and specialization; employers can pay higher skilled workers more and offer convenient shifts or extra allowances to secure, as in one example cited, quality elder care.

Domestic workers describe contracts as being as much about trust, dignity and empowerment as about wages and conditions. As one informant from a 'model' placement agency said, a written contract 'is made as a binder of trust' (Utama & Kusumawati 2015). Workers recount successful negotiations with pride. Santi describes how she left one job where she was ordered to clean a toilet without gloves or brush, telling her employer, 'I am indeed a domestic worker, Sir, but I also have a sense of dignity' (Irham & Andapita 2015a). As a

union member, she said, 'I learned to stand on my own ... rejecting any job without adequate facilities and equipment. Workers want good relationships - 'we don't demand a big salary' they explained, but want clean, safe and modern working conditions ("Lack of OSH Protection for Domestic Workers (2)" 2015). One union member, Ririn Sulastri, persuaded an employer to agree to a contract by talking about feelings, recalling that:

At first the family ... was stunned by the request. But I tried to make them understand it. When speaking over the phone and during a meeting, I explained that ... if the family didn't feel comfortable with me, the contract could be dropped. It would also be applied to me if I didn't feel comfortable. (Da Costa 2015)

On other occasions, Ririn starts with a daily contract 'until', she says, 'I feel I have chemistry (*cocok*, ILO translation) with the family' (Irham & Andapita 2015b). In conversation with journalists, domestic workers script new stories about themselves as more equal. As 'modern' domestic workers they can and do speak up for their rights, but being professional does not mean abandoning reciprocity. Rather than deleting the past, these workers contribute to global discussions about how to preserve positive aspects of 'family-likeness' within a contemporary context, acknowledging that 'domestic service is more than a material relation of labor - it is also an affective, psychic and sensory condition' (Ally 2011, p. 4).

The Bill Deferred

Four journalists tackled the question of why Indonesia had not ratified Convention 189 or passed a Domestic Workers' law. Their writing was well-informed; at the three-day training for prospective fellows held in Bogor in early June 2016, an expert member of the secretariat for Commission IX at the DPR had presented 53 slides giving an insider view of the content, processes and (lack of) progress of draft legislation.¹¹ The final articles followed a pattern. Journalists used vignettes and quoted domestic workers and JALA PRT supporters to make an emotionally laden, rights-oriented case for the bill, described the repeated rebuttals of draft legislation and quoted members of parliament, government officials or housewives to balance JALA PRT views.

Oppositional voices told a story of continuing disregard. Legislation interfered with the 'rights' of employers or the interests of 'the community'. Comments such as 'not all employers are from the middle and upper classes' ... we don't want this policy to burden the community' or 'a law must ... not violate

the rights of all components of the community pit the rights of workers against the interests of the more privileged (Irham & Andapita 2015c). Arguments such as 'about the working hours, the employer must agree first ... do they want their PRT to work 10 hours from the early morning to 5pm and then after that she may rest?' or 'the opinion of mothers of households as users ... or employers ... their voices need to be heard so that the rules are more balanced' recognize domestic workers as workers but impose material and emotional binds (Ikhbal 2015). Instead of the state acting to protect vulnerable employees, opponents want laws to protect employers. Responsibility is left with 'mothers of households', putting domestic work back into the domestic sphere. No wonder, as one journalist describes, when Wiwin, a member of Sapulidi Domestic Workers' Union, went to meet members of Commission IX at the DPR and heard that the Bill would not be in the *Prolegnas*, her smile shrank (Ikhbal 2015).

Some politicians and officers who were interviewed blamed the political system (or each other) for stalling the bill. In an article with the headline *The DPR plays Ping Pong with the PRT Bill*, some parliamentarians blamed Baleg, the body responsible for coordinating legislation, who had sent the Bill back for further discussion, while others viewed the relevant Commission - where some members felt that 'the number of cases [of ill-treatment] is relatively small' - was at fault. Some wanted local governments to legislate while others believed 'a ministerial regulation is considered more appropriate to the condition of Indonesian society'. A civil servant suggested that 'the Government has not ratified the ILO Convention for fear of colliding with the PPRT (Domestic Workers' Bill) in the House'. Even though journalists printed the promises of some politicians that the Bill could be revised and re-introduced, the takeaway message was the bleak one that powerful voices, after considering the issues, still preferred to brush the question of legislative protection aside.

Conclusion

Wider acceptance of the need for a Domestic Workers Law cannot be achieved without the support of a well-informed and sympathetic media, as PROMOTE project organizers knew full well. With training, incentives and support at the individual and organizational level, journalists devised positive scripts to replace stock media stereotypes and gave space for domestic workers to speak. There is some evidence that the journalistic environment is changing; 82 journalists, for

example, entered articles and broadcasts in an AJI/ILO competition for awards for the best journalism about domestic work published in 2015-2016 and the capacity building specialist at the PROMOTE project reported to me that ILO monitoring indicated increased coverage of domestic worker stories following their interventions (Field note 2016, 22 November; observation of award ceremony; Nour 2017, personal communication). However, powerful opponents of the Bill also gained a platform as journalists represented employer and government perspectives alongside workers' views, in line with the ethics of balanced journalism and ILO tripartism. Some want to pass responsibility back to the domestic domain, leaving female employers and employees to resolve issues between them.

Comparing articles published in 2004 and 2008 with those of 2015 reveals a new repertoire of domestic worker tropes which portray domestic workers as active citizens, confident union members and organizers and modern professionals who contribute to the economy. Journalists challenged distinctions between home and overseas domestic work and undermined notions that 'being one of the family' protects. NGOs, unions, journalists' and media organizations will need to continue to train other journalists to do the same. This study also draws attention to the value of talking in terms of emotion, mutual assistance and harmony - the domestic workers' 'chemistry'. This adds 'affect' to the language of rights, extending the campaign toolkit (Gutiérrez Rodríguez 2009, pp. 160-169; Poo 2011). Journalists were motivated by financial incentives and wish for professional recognition but inspired by contacts with workers and NGO organizers. Senior figures in the media, - Endy Bayuni, Editor-in-Chief of the *Jakarta Post*, Burhan Solihin, Executive Editor of *Tempo.co* and Mohamad Teguh, Editor-in-Chief of SCTV judged the entries in the nationwide competition for best reporting on domestic worker issues in November 2016, suggesting a shift in the media environment (ILO Jakarta 2016). However, despite increased and improved media coverage, the Domestic Worker Bill was not included in the list of priority legislation for the Indonesian parliament announced in December 2016 (Affan 2017). It had, again, disappeared.

The character at the center of Ann Stoler's account of colonial disregard, Frans Carl Valck, lost his civil service job for writing reports of planter brutality which no one wanted to hear. He disappeared from the (official) archive after being dismissed for outspokenness (Stoler 2009, p. 182; p. 238). By contrast, the archive of the

PROMOTE project features domestic workers as experts whose confident, feminist inspired 'knowledge-from-experience' is set against prevarication from politicians and civil servants. In August 2017 the ILO and JALA PRT signaled a refusal of silencing strategies by showcasing domestic worker citizen journalism ("Book Launching and Monologues: 'Inspiring Life Stories of Indonesian Domestic Workers'" 2017). Given the need for the domestic worker movement to steel itself to continue its campaigning for the foreseeable future, in the face of the government's seemingly resolute stance against the Bill (personal communication with well-informed journalist and PRT supporter 2016, 25 November), getting images of domestic workers as active citizens into the archive and onto the web becomes another, enduring, means of challenging cultures of disregard. The record will, surely, be one of which the movement can be proud.

List of References

- Affan, H 2017, "Household Domestic Workers Bill Has Not Been Discussed, Domestic Workers Are 'Vulnerable to Discrimination'", *BBC Indonesia*, 16 June, viewed 25 July 2017, <http://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-40284570>
- AJI Jakarta 2015, "Beasiswa Peliputan: Urgensi Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Pekerja Rumah Tangga", *Aliansi Jurnalis Independen (AJI) Jakarta*, 1 June, viewed 27 July 2017, <http://www.ajijakarta.org/2015/06/01/beasiswa-peliputan-urgensi-perlindungan-hukum-bagi-pekerja-rumah-tangga/>
- Ally, S 2011, "Domestics, 'Dirty Work' and the Affects of Domination", *South African Review of Sociology*, vol. 42, no.2, pp. 1-7.
- Anya, A 2016, "Do People Still Need RT/ RW Heads?", *Jakarta Post*, June 2.
- Austin, M 2016, "Defending Indonesia's Migrant Domestic Workers", in L Bakker, W Berenschot & HS Nordholt (eds.), *Citizenship and Democratization in Southeast Asia*, Brill, Leiden, pp. 265-288.
- Blackburn, S 2004 *Women and the State in Modern Indonesia*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- "Book Launching and Monologues: 'Inspiring Life Stories of Indonesian Domestic Workers'" 2017, Seminar, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/whatwedo/eventsandmeetings/WCMS_562933/lang--en/index.htm.
- Bowen 1986, "On the Political Construction of Tradition: *Gotong Royong* in Indonesia", *Journal of Asian Studies*, vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 545-561.
- Byerly, C 2016, "Stasis and Shifts in Feminist Media Scholarship", in C Cerqueira, R Cabecinhas, and S Magalhaes (eds.), *Gender in Focus: (New) Trends in Media*, CECS, Braga, pp. 15-27.
- Chan, C 2014, "Gendered Morality and Development Narratives: The Case of Female Labour Migration from Indonesia", *Sustainability*, no. 6, pp. 6949-6972.

- Da Costa, AB 2015, "Without Contracts Domestic Worker Rights Unprotected", *ILO: International Labour Organization*, 28 August, viewed 16 June 2017, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/fs/WCMS_464070/lang--en/index.htm.
- Fechter, AM 2007, *Transnational Lives: Expatriates in Indonesia*, Hants: Ashgate, Aldershot.
- Gouda, F, Raben R, Nordholt, HS & Stoler, AL 2009, "Ann Laura Stoler, Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense"; *Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land-En Volkenkunde/ Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences of Southeast Asia*, vol. 165, no. 4, pp. 551–567.
- Gutierrez Rodríguez, E 2009, *Migration, Domestic Work and Affect*, Routledge, London and New York.
- Ikhbal, AM 2015, "Belum Ada Usaha Maksimal Lindungi PRT (Bagian 3 Habis)", *Republika*, August 21.
- Ikhbal, AM 2017, "Workers Who Are Still Considered as Housemaids", *Republika*, August 19.
- ILO Jakarta 2010, *ILO Jakarta: Recognizing Domestic Work as Work*, ILO Jakarta, Jakarta, http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@asia/@ro-bangkok/@ilo-jakarta/documents/publication/wcms_125946.pdf.
- ILO Jakarta 2016, "ILO-AJI Jakarta to Launch Media Award for the Best Reportages on the Protections of Domestic Workers", *ILO Jakarta*, 14 August, viewed 26 July 2017, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/pr/WCMS_512510/lang--en/index.htm
- Irham, M & Andapita, V 2015a, "When Domestic Workers United in Trade Union (Part 2)", *Varia News*, 15 August, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/fs/WCMS_470253/lang--en/index.htm.
- Irham, M & Andapita, V 2015b, "When Domestic Workers United in Trade Union", *Varia News*, 15 August, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/fs/WCMS_470252/lang--en/index.htm.
- Irham, M & Andapita, V 2015c, "Steep Road of Draft Law on Protection of Domestic Workers", *Varia News*, 15 August, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/fs/WCMS_470254/lang--en/index.htm.
- "Si Mbak Mudik Asyik Agar Balik Lagi (2)" 2008, *Kompas.com*, 27 September, accessed 24 July 2017, <http://news.kompas.com/read/2008/09/27/11135044/si.mbak.mudik.asyik.agar.balik.lagi.2>
- "Lack of OSH Protection for Domestic Workers (2)" 2015, KBR Saga, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/fs/WCMS_464068/lang--en/index.htm.
- Munt, SR 2016, "Argumentum Ad Misericordiam: The Cultural Politics of Victim Media", *Feminist Media Studies*, pp. 1–18, doi:10.1080/14680777.2016.1259176.
- Nababan, A 2003, "Maria Hartiningsih: Indonesia", *UDHR-Heroes*, <http://www.uuniversalrights.net/heroes/display.php3?id=80>.
- Nilan, P, Demartoto, A, Broom, A & Germov, J 2014, "Indonesian Men's Perceptions of Violence Against Women", *Violence Against Women*, vol. 20, no. 7, pp 869–888.
- Niner, S, Cuthbert, D & Ahmad Y 2014, "Good Mothers, Bad Mothers", *Feminist Media Studies*, vol. 14, no. 6, pp. 993–1011, doi:10.1080/14680777.2013.854822.
- Nurbaiti, A 2000, "Labor Migration and Media Coverage in Indonesia", paper presented at *Regional Consultation on Media and Labor Migration*, 21-23 August, Manila, viewed 22 June 2017, <https://dr.ntu.edu.sg/handle/10220/3154>.
- Pinho, PdS 2015, "The Dirty Body That Cleans: Representations of Domestic Workers in Brazilian Common Sense", *Meridians: Feminism, Race, Transnationalism*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 103–128.
- Poo, A 2011, *Organizing with Love: Lessons from the New York Domestic Workers Bill of Rights Campaign*, Centre for the Education of Women, University of Michigan, viewed 20 June 2017, http://www.cew.umich.edu/sites/default/files/Organizingwithlove--FullReport-Cover_0.pdf.
- Robinson, K 1991, "Housemaids: The Effect of Gender and Culture on the Internal and International Migration of Indonesian Women", in G Bottomley, M de Lepervanche & J Martin (eds.), *Intersexions: Gender/Class/Culture/Ethnicity*, Allen & Unwin, Sidney, pp. 33–51.
- Steele, J 2011a, "Indonesian Journalism Post-Suharto: Changing Ideals and Professional Practices", in K Sen & D Hill (eds.), *Politics and the Media in Twenty-First Century Indonesia: Decade of Democracy*, Routledge, London and New York.
- Steele, J 2011b, "Justice and Journalism: Islam and Journalistic Values in Indonesia and Malaysia", *Journalism*, vol. 12, no. 5, pp. 533–549.
- Steele, J 2013, "From Fashion to the Hereafter: Indonesia's *Republika*, a Modern Islamic Newspaper", *Media Asia (Asian Media Information & Communication Centre)*, vol. 40, no. 1, p. 27.
- Stoler, AL 2009, *Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Commonsense*, Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ.
- U.S. Department of Labor 2012, "Technical Cooperation Project Summary, PROMOTE: Decent Work for Domestic Workers to End Child Domestic Work", U.S. Department of Labor, International Labor Affairs Bureau, viewed 23 February 2017, https://www.dol.gov/ilab/projects/summaries/Indonesia_PROMOTE.pdf.
- Utama, A & Kusumawati, UD 2015, "Being Child Domestic Worker, Yantri's Careless Choice", *CNN Indonesia*, 19 September, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/info/public/fs/WCMS_461058/lang--en/index.htm.

End Notes

- 1 For an example of how good women/bad woman binaries divert attention from structural issues see the discussion of media depictions of motherhood in Malaysia in Niner, S et al (2014).
- 2 For example, a story in the *Jakarta Post*, 24 July 2008 carried the headline 'Mentally ill woman 'beat maids to death'.
- 3 I am hugely indebted to everyone who helped me, to all my informants, and to SOAS and the A.L. Lawson Charitable Trust who funded some of my fieldwork and language training.
- 4 Thanks to Zahra Sakinatuzzahra, a student at the University of Indonesia, who conducted the search on my behalf.
- 5 Here I have used the translation of the *Kompas* article which featured in an ILO Special Report under the heading 'Workers Voices'.

- 6 The literal meaning of Rukun Warga is 'harmonious citizen'. The RW in one of two neighbourhood level administrative units in Indonesia, its role variously viewed as reporting to the government, making sure the neighbourhood resembles 'a big family', taking a welfare role in relation to vulnerable residents or, at its worst, a means for extortion over issue of identity cards (Anya 2016).
- 7 Thanks to Tyas Puspo, NGO researcher, for assistance with interviews.
- 8 For further details see the ILO PROMOTE project website, http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/whatwedo/projects/WCMS_210965/lang-en/index.htm, accessed 24 July 2017.
- 9 For a discussion of the issues around the strategic use of child victims of trafficking by NGOs in a Southeast Asian context see Sallie Yea (2013) *Mobilising the Child Victim: The Localisation of Human Trafficking in Singapore through Global Activism* DOI: 10.1068/d15411.
- 10 *Ngenger* is a Javanese word that refers to a customary practice in Java whereby a child stays in the house of a distant relative or sometimes someone who is not a relative, but is considered as part of the family.
- 11 Thanks to Muhamad Nour for sending me a copy of the presentation.

Expression of Gratitude to Reviewers

1. Prof. Mayling Oey-Gardiner (Universitas Indonesia)
2. Dr. Kristi Poerwandari (Universitas Indonesia)
3. Dr. Ida Ruwaida Noor (Universitas Indonesia)
4. Dr. Arianti Ina Restiani Hunga (Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana)
5. Tracy Wright Webster, PhD (University of Western Australia)
6. Dr. Phill. Ratna Noviani (Universitas Gadjah Mada)
7. Antarini Pratiwi Arna (Oxfam in Indonesia)
8. Dr. Wening Udasmoro (Universitas Gadjah Mada)

YAYASAN
YJP
JURNAL
PEREMPUAN

Jl. Karang Pola Dalam II No. 9A
Jati Padang, Pasar Minggu,
Jakarta Selatan 12540
INDONESIA
Phone/Fax: +62 21 22701689



FORDFOUNDATION

